

Edited by Gaby Oré Aguilar and Felipe Gómez Isa

# Rethinking Transitions

Equality and Social Justice  
in Societies Emerging from Conflict



6  
SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE



intersentia

# CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i> .....	v
<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	vii
<b>Introduction</b>	
Gaby ORÉ AGUILAR and Felipe GÓMEZ ISA .....	1
<b>Addressing Horizontal Inequalities in Post-Conflict Reconstruction</b>	
Graham K. BROWN, Corinne CAUMARTIN, Arnim LANGER and Frances STEWART .....	11
Introduction .....	11
1. Groups, horizontal inequalities and conflicts .....	12
2. An overview of policies towards reducing HIs in post-conflict countries .....	19
3. Do post-conflict policies include policies towards reducing inequalities? .....	26
4. Conclusion .....	29
<b>A Critique of Rights in Transitional Justice: The African Experience</b>	
Makau MUTUA .....	31
Introduction .....	31
1. Human rights and the African reality .....	34
2. Can human rights recover the African state? .....	35
3. Reconceiving transitional justice .....	38
4. The limitations of transitional justice concepts .....	40
5. As a way of conclusion .....	45
<b>Gender Equality and Women's Human Rights in Conflict Situations: Evolving Perspectives</b>	
Sunila ABEYSEKERA .....	47
Introduction .....	47
1. Issues of inequality: from a gender lens .....	49
2. The role of women in conflict: issues of inequality .....	50
3. The narrow focus on women in conflict situations; the early years of the 20 <sup>th</sup> century wars .....	53

4. Modern wars: from the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century to the present . . . 56
5. Contemporary framing of the impact of conflict on women . . . . . 60
6. Conclusion: moving forward to achieve a substantive equality for women in conflict situations. . . . . 64

#### Women in the Sri Lankan Peace Process: Included but Unequal

Kumudini SAMUEL . . . . . 67

- Introduction: the gendered nature of peacemaking. . . . . 67
1. The Sri Lankan peace process. . . . . 69
  2. Lessons from the peace process . . . . . 72
    - 2.1. Stages in a peace process . . . . . 73
    - 2.2. Pre-negotiation stage . . . . . 73
    - 2.3. Framework/substantive stage . . . . . 74
  3. Women's engagement with the formal peace process . . . . . 75
    - 3.1. Women call for a stronger ceasefire agreement. . . . . 75
    - 3.2. Women call for a gender sensitive framework to peacemaking . . . . 76
  4. Appointment of the Sub-Committee on gender issues . . . . . 78
    - 4.1. Confidence building. . . . . 79
    - 4.2. Women or gender. . . . . 81
    - 4.3. Division of responsibility and agenda setting . . . . . 82
    - 4.4. SGI's terms of reference. . . . . 83
  5. Conflict and masculinity . . . . . 86
  6. Analysing the Sub-Committee on gender issues. . . . . 87
    - 6.1. Appointment and composition . . . . . 87
    - 6.2. Autonomy and compromise . . . . . 89
    - 6.3. Marginalisation from mainstream agenda . . . . . 89
    - 6.4. Inclusiveness . . . . . 92
  7. Representation and participation: dilemmas, challenges and lessons learnt. . . . . 93
    - 7.1. Engaging with militant women . . . . . 93
    - 7.2. Engagement with the State . . . . . 94
    - 7.3. Political autonomy . . . . . 95
    - 7.4. Engagement with civil society and the politics of coalition building . . . . . 98
  8. Reclaiming the emancipatory politics of feminism . . . . . 99
  9. Way forward: negotiating political engagement for social transformation . . . . . 100

#### Horizontal Inequalities in Post-Conflict Reconstruction: Guatemala and Nepal

Graham K. BROWN and Corinne CAUMARTIN. . . . . 101

- Introduction . . . . . 101
1. Guatemala . . . . . 102
    - 1.1. Ethnic differences and indigenous issues fuelling conflict . . . . . 102
    - 1.2. HIs concerns in the peace accords. . . . . 105
    - 1.3. Limits and achievements in addressing HIs in post-conflict Guatemala . . . . . 107
  2. Nepal . . . . . 114
    - 2.1. Ethnic differences and indigenous issues fuelling conflict . . . . . 115
    - 2.2. HIs concerns in foreign aid and reconstruction . . . . . 119
  3. Conclusion. . . . . 121

#### Asserting Women's Economic and Social Rights in Transitions

Gaby ORÉ AGUILAR . . . . . 123

- Introduction . . . . . 123
1. Socio-economic vulnerability of women in conflict. . . . . 126
    - 1.1. Violations of women's social and economic rights . . . . . 127
    - 1.2. Reconstruction policies and financing: deficits in gender equality and women's human rights . . . . . 131
  2. Economic and social rights standards in post-conflict . . . . . 135
    - 2.1. The absence of economic and social rights. . . . . 135
    - 2.2. Key features of the economic and social rights normative framework . . . . . 138
      - 2.2.1. State obligations. . . . . 139
      - 2.2.2. Non-discrimination . . . . . 140
        - 2.2.2.1. Definitions . . . . . 141
        - 2.2.2.2. Mandatory and immediate . . . . . 141
        - 2.2.2.3. Formal (*de jure*) and substantive (*de facto*) discrimination . . . . . 142
        - 2.2.2.4. Special temporary measures . . . . . 142
        - 2.2.2.5. Obligation to regulate and monitor the conduct of non-state actors. . . . . 142
        - 2.2.2.6. Direct and indirect discrimination . . . . . 143
        - 2.2.2.7. Systemic discrimination. . . . . 143
        - 2.2.2.8. Multiple discrimination. . . . . 143
      - 2.2.3. Non-derogation . . . . . 143
      - 2.2.4. Minimum core obligations . . . . . 144
      - 2.2.5. Obligations in contexts of 'severe resources constraints' . . . 145

2.3. CESCR, concluding observations on conflict and post-conflict countries .....	146
2.3.1. Recommendations on countries immersed in conflict .....	147
2.3.2. Recommendations on countries in transition .....	148
3. ESCR in transitional justice mechanisms .....	152
3.1. Prosecutions .....	153
3.2. Reparation adjudications .....	156
3.3. Truth commissions .....	163
3.4. Policy and institutional reform .....	164
4. Conclusions and way forward .....	166

#### Exploitation of Natural Resources in Conflict Situations:

##### The Colombian Case

Giulia TAMAYO .....	171
---------------------	-----

Introduction .....	171
1. Preliminary considerations .....	175
1.1. The impact of conflicts on the environment and ecosystem .....	177
1.2. The impact of state policies and natural resource management during conflicts .....	178
1.2.1. Gender impact in armed conflicts .....	179
1.2.2. The impact of conflict on indigenous peoples .....	180
1.3. Resource management policies and national security .....	182
2. Responsibilities under international law .....	183
2.1. Responsibilities for violations of the right to the environment and natural resources .....	183
2.2. Responsibilities of the state and non-state actors for violations of the rights of women and indigenous peoples .....	185
2.3. Perspectives on international responsibility for environmental and natural resource protection in contexts of armed conflict .....	188
3. Colombia: a prolonged conflict with high human and environmental costs .....	189
3.1. Land occupation by paramilitary and armed non-state belligerents .....	191
3.2. The linkages between national security policies and the eradication of coca plantations .....	191
3.3. Human rights violations and environmental defenders .....	194
3.3.1. Impact on women's rights .....	195
3.3.2. Impact on indigenous peoples and Afro-descendants .....	198
3.3.2.1. Loss of habitat and forced displacement .....	198
3.3.2.2. Investments and mega-projects in indigenous lands and Afro-Colombian communities .....	201

3.4. Legitimation of the appropriation of indigenous territories and resources .....	203
4. Conclusions and perspectives .....	204

#### Indigenous Peoples and Peace Agreements: Transforming Relationships or Empty Rhetoric?

Jérémie GILBERT .....	207
-----------------------	-----

Introduction .....	207
1. The new deal: redefining the state .....	209
1.1. The recognition of the indigenous identity .....	209
1.2. Negotiating self-determination and autonomy .....	213
1.3. Political rights and political participation .....	217
1.4. Land rights .....	218
2. Empty rhetoric: limitations to the implementation of peace agreements .....	220
2.1. The ILO and peace agreements: the case of Mexico and Bangladesh .....	222
2.2. The UN and the monitoring of implementation: the case of Guatemala .....	225
Conclusion and way forward .....	228

#### Gender in Post-Conflict Reconstruction Processes in Africa

Itziar RUIZ-GIMÉNEZ ARRIETA .....	231
-----------------------------------	-----

Introduction: incorporating gender in the world of peacebuilding .....	231
1. Obstacles to integrating gender equality in peacebuilding .....	235
1.1. The implementation of universal prescriptions .....	236
1.1.1. The illusion of neutrality in post-conflict intervention .....	236
1.1.2. Invisibility of gender in the genesis of violence and in political resistance struggles .....	238
1.1.3. The rebuilding of exclusive systems .....	241
1.1.4. Identity and diversity in the experience of women .....	241
1.2. Barriers to the effective integration of women and gender issues in peace missions .....	243
1.3. Obstacles to the effective inclusion of African women in peace processes .....	247
1.3.1. Factors endogenous to African countries .....	250
1.3.2. Conflicting factors in the 'liberal peace complex' .....	251
1.3.2.1. Strengthening of armed combatants in peace processes .....	251
1.3.2.2. A policy of selective justice and impunity .....	252

1.3.2.3. Strengthening warlords and weakening the rule of law .....	253
1.3.2.4. Challenges to the inclusion of gender in peace agreements .....	254
2. Gender and the 'liberal peace complex' at cross purposes .....	255
2.1. The security dimension .....	255
2.2. The political dimension .....	257
2.3. The economic dimension .....	260
3. Conclusions and recommendations for an effective implementation of Resolution 1325 .....	262

## Repairing Historical Injustices: Indigenous Peoples in Post-Conflict Scenarios

Felipe GÓMEZ ISA .....	265
------------------------	-----

Introduction .....	265
1. The right to reparation for past abuses .....	266
1.1. Reparation as an integral process .....	272
1.2. Forms of reparation .....	273
2. The progressive recognition of indigenous peoples' right to reparation for historical injustices .....	278
2.1. The Durban Process .....	279
2.2. The UN Declaration on the rights of indigenous peoples .....	285
3. Indigenous peoples in armed conflict contexts: the Colombian case ....	287
4. Reparation for historical injustices in post-conflict situations: the Guatemala case .....	293
5. Conclusion and way forward .....	299

## Privatising the Use of Force: Accountability and Implications for Local Communities

JOSÉ L. GÓMEZ DEL PRADO .....	301
-------------------------------	-----

Introduction .....	301
1. The privatisation of warfare and security in low-intensity and post-conflict contexts .....	304
2. Blurring the boundaries of humanitarian work: who are the private military and security companies .....	308
3. Victims or perpetrators? Who are the 'private security guards'? .....	312
4. Impact on the local populations and lack of accountability .....	315
4.1. Iraq: humanitarian crisis and insecurity .....	316
4.2. Afghanistan: a free-market logic of justice and reconstruction ....	319
Conclusion and way forward .....	322

About the Authors .....	327
-------------------------	-----