

Contents

Acknowledgments ix

Abbreviations x

- 1 Introduction 1**
 - 1.1 Criticism Addressing the Lack of a Principled Approach 6
 - 1.2 Legitimacy of the Procedural Outcomes: To Elicit a Pull towards Compliance 7
 - 1.3 Developing a Standard: How to Review and Develop Procedural Law Governing Facts and Evidence 9
 - 1.4 Structure of This Volume 16
 - 1.5 Sources of the Law of Facts and Evidence in International Human Rights Proceedings 17
- 2 Definitions and Procedural Concepts 22**
 - 2.1 Standard of Proof, Evaluation of Evidence and Admission of Evidence 22
 - 2.2 The Burden of Proof – The Persuasive Burden 23
 - 2.3 Adversary and Investigatory Proceedings in Theory 27
 - 2.4 The Evidentiary Burden, the Burden to Come Forward with Evidence and the Tactical Burden 28
 - 2.5 A Shift in the Burden of Proof vs. Facilitation of Proof Such as Factual Presumptions/Prima-Facie Evidence 38
 - 2.6 Fact-Finding by an International Human Rights Institution 39
- 3 Parameters of the Procedural Frameworks of International Human Rights Institutions Framing the Law Relating to Facts and Evidence 41**
 - 3.1 European Court of Human Rights 41
 - 3.2 Inter-American Court of Human Rights 48
 - 3.3 UN Human Rights Committee 64
 - 3.4 Implications for the Following Analysis of the Evidentiary Process 76
- 4 Subsidiarity and the Evidentiary Procedure 78**
 - 4.1 Deference: The Interrelation between Subsidiarity and the Facts Established in the Domestic Proceedings 78

- 4.2 Subsidiarity: Limits to the ECtHR's Fact-Finding and Evaluation of Evidence 81
- 4.3 Subsidiarity and Deference in the Two-Entity-System of the Inter-American System 97
- 4.4 Subsidiarity: Limits to the Committee's Fact-Finding and Evaluation of Evidence 101
- 4.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 110
- 5 **Standard of Proof in International Human Rights Proceedings** 112
 - 5.1 Introduction to the Concept of a Contextualized Standard of Proof 113
 - 5.2 Standard of Proof in the Proceedings of the European Court of Human Rights 126
 - 5.3 Standard of Proof in the Proceedings of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 137
 - 5.4 Standard of Proof in the Proceedings of the UN Human Rights Committee 143
 - 5.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 147
- 6 **Allocation of the Persuasive Burden in International Human Rights Proceedings** 149
 - 6.1 Approaches regarding the Allocation of the Persuasive Burden 149
 - 6.2 Allocation of the Persuasive Burden in the Procedure before the European Court of Human Rights 161
 - 6.3 Allocation of the Persuasive Burden in the Procedure before the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 205
 - 6.4 Allocation of the Persuasive Burden in the Procedure before the Human Rights Committee 233
 - 6.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 272
- 7 **The Introduction of Facts and Evidence in the Proceedings of International Human Rights Institutions** 275
 - 7.1 Investigatory or Adversarial Proceedings – The Theoretical Foundation and Procedural Reality 276
 - 7.2 The Introduction of Facts and Evidence in the Procedure of the ECtHR 285
 - 7.3 The Introduction of Facts and Evidence in the Procedure before the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 332

- 7.4 The Introduction of Facts and Evidence in the Procedure before the U.N. Human Rights Committee 363
- 7.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 380
- 8 The Lack of Cooperation by the Respondent State 385
 - 8.1 Non-Cooperation with Respect to the Establishment of the Facts and Why There Must Not Be Default Findings 385
 - 8.2 Consequences of Non-Cooperation by the Respondent State – European Court of Human Rights 395
 - 8.3 Consequences of Non-Cooperation – Inter-American Court of Human Rights 406
 - 8.4 Consequences of Non-Cooperation – Human Rights Committee 411
 - 8.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 417
- 9 The Admission of Evidence in Proceedings before Human Rights Institutions 419
 - 9.1 Introduction 419
 - 9.2 Admission of Evidence before the European Court of Human Rights 428
 - 9.3 Admission of Evidence before the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 433
 - 9.4 Admission of Evidence before the U.N. Human Rights Committee 440
 - 9.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 443
- 10 The Evaluation of Evidence by the Human Rights Institutions 445
 - 10.1 Introduction to the Systems of Assessing Evidence 445
 - 10.2 The Evaluation of Evidence by European Court of Human Rights 449
 - 10.3 The Evaluation of Evidence by the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 455
 - 10.4 The Evaluation of Evidence by the UN Human Rights Committee 460
 - 10.5 Summary and Problems in Need of Addressing 462
- 11 Rationalizing and Advancing the Law Governing Facts and Evidence on the Basis of a Sui-Generis, Contextualized Approach 464
 - 11.1 Subsidiarity and the Law Governing Facts and Evidence 465

- 11.2 Proposal for a Contextualized Standard of Proof 468
- 11.3 The Persuasive Burden and Its Link to the Substantive Law 470
- 11.4 Fact-Finding and Facts and Evidence Presented by the Parties,
Factual Presumptions and Tactical Burden 473
- 11.5 Consequences of Non-Cooperation 477
- 11.6 Admission and Evaluation of Evidence 480

Bibliography 483

Index 503