

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	ix
Acknowledgements	xv
Table of Agreements, Charters, Committees, Conventions, Declarations, Resolutions, Recommendations, and Treaties	xvii
Table of Cases	xxiii
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations	xxvii
Introduction	xxix
1. The International Legal Protection of Minorities in the Twentieth Century: A Preliminary Orientation	1
I. The Question of Definition: Identifying the Beneficiaries of the International Law on the Protection of Minorities	1
A. Problems Associated with Identifying 'Minorities' as a Non-State Community in International Law	1
B. The Meaning of 'Minorities' for the Purposes of International Law	8
C. Conclusion	15
II. Methods of Minority Protection	16
A. The Nature of Minority Rights: Individual or Collective	16
B. Typology of Minority Protection	18
III. Pre 20th Century Approaches towards the International Legal Protection of Minorities	20
A. Origins: The Protection of Religious Minorities in Europe	20
B. Approaches towards Minority Protection outside Europe	21
C. Minority Protection and the 'Public Law of Europe' in the 19th Century	22
2. The Inter-war Era & the First Institutional Attempt at the International Regulation of the Problem of Minorities	27
I. Setting the Context: The Minorities Regime as a Facet of the Post-War Versailles Peace Settlement	27
A. Addressing the Nationalist Challenge at Versailles	27
B. The Principle of National Self-Determination at the Paris Peace Conference	32
C. The Challenge of the Interwar Legal Framework to Statist Positivism: A "New" International Law?	36
D. Possible Fault-lines in the Versailles Settlement which could be exploited by Nationalist Sentiment	38
II. The Problem of National Minorities and its Impact on the Identification of the Beneficiaries of the Minorities Regime	45
A. The Particular Character of the Minorities Regime	45
B. Cultural Bias and Different Approaches Towards Minorities Issues	46
C. The Understanding of the Nature of 'Minorities' During the League Era	55
D. Identifying the Beneficiaries: Individuals or Groups?	61
E. Challenges to the Narrowness of the Definition	64

III. The Institutional Framework of the Minorities Regime	66
A. The Basis and Status of the League Minorities Regime	66
B. The Nature of the Institutional Guarantee	67
C. The League Institutions Overseeing Minorities Issues	68
C. The Substance of Minority Rights and the Role of the Government	73
IV. The Operation of the Minorities Regime	79
A. Managing the Interests of Minority States, Minorities and the International Community	79
B. Operational Principles: The Impersonal Approach	80
C. The Conciliatory Ethos & the Guardianship of Minorities	83
D. Avoiding the Imputation of a Judicial Character to the Examination of Petitions	86
E. The Issue of Publicity	87
F. Attitudes towards the Petitions Procedure?	88
V. Evaluating the Minorities Regime: A Remarkable but Doomed Experiment?	91
A. The Death of the League Minorities Regime	91
B. The Instability in the Peace Settlements and the Subversion of the Minorities System	95
C. Contributions of the Inter-war Era	97
3. The End of the 'Remarkable Experiment': Approaches towards Minority Protection in the Aftermath of World War Two	99
I. Minorities Issues at the Peace Conference: A Low Profile	101
A. The Problem of Nationalities and the Post-War Retreat of Multilateral Initiatives	101
II. Minorities' Issues and the Founding of the United Nations Organisation	106
A. From Dumbarton Oaks to San Francisco: The Push for a Commitment to Human Rights	107
B. The United Nations Charter & the Human Rights Focus	109
C. The Minorities Issue: Carving an Early Institutional Niche	113
D. The Failed International Engagement over Palestine	114
III. The <i>Ad hoc</i> Inclusion of 'Special Measures' for Minorities Protection in Peace Treaties after 1947	115
A. Mode of Enforcement	115
B. Content: Special Protective Measures Beyond Prohibitions against Discrimination	116
IV. Conclusion	116
4. The Submergence and Gradual Reemergence of Minorities Issues within the United Nations Human Rights Regime 1945-1989	119
I. Institutional Framework within which Minority Issues Were Addressed	121
A. Parent-Child Tensions: The Relationship between the Commission of Human Rights and the Sub-Commission for the Prevention of Discrimination and the Protection of Minorities	121
II. A Cautious, Minimalist Approach towards the Protection of Minorities	129
A. The Elaboration of Human Rights Standards & The Reticence Towards Minority Rights	129
B. The 1966 International Covenants: Article 27 as the Sole Conventional Minorities Clause	139

C. Beyond the International Bill of Rights: General Human Rights Instruments affording Indirect Protection to Minorities	145
III. Approaches towards the Definition of Minorities	146
A. Clarifying the Mandate of the SCPDPM: A Conservative Bent	147
B. 'Minorities' for the Purposes of Conventional Obligations	149
IV. Concluding Observations	157
5. The Revival in Minorities Issues within the United Nations (1989-2000): Approaches towards Substance and Definition	161
I. Refocusing on Minority Protection: The Sub-Commission for the Prevention of Discrimination and the Protection of Minorities	164
A. The Turn Towards Pragmatic Problem Solving: Mapping out a Plan of Action	164
II. The 1992 Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities	172
A. The Normative Framework of the 1992 Declaration	173
B. The Substantive Content of the 1992 Declaration	176
C. Evaluating the Declaration	184
III. Attitudes towards Definition	188
A. The Absence of a Definition in the 1992 Minorities Declaration	188
B. The Role of Personal Choice in Identifying Minority Members	191
C. Approaches Adopted within the Working Group on Minorities	191
IV. Conclusion	196
6. The Implementation of Minority Rights within the United Nations Human Rights Regime	199
I. Charter-Based Bodies and the Implementation of the Human Rights of Minorities	200
A. The Monitoring Procedures of Politically Controlled Bodies	200
II. The UN Minorities Declaration, the Working Group on Minorities and the Implementation of Minority Rights	205
A. Creating a Focal Point: The Working Group on Minorities	206
B. The Mandate & Perceived Role of the Working Group on Minorities	208
C. The Operation of the Working Group on Minorities	209
D. Assessing the Work of the Working Group on Minorities	212
III. Treaty Based Bodies and the Implementation of Minority Rights	217
A. Mode of Implementation by Independent Monitoring Bodies	218
B. The Nature of State Obligations in relation to Minority-Related Provisions	220
C. Minority Concerns in Relation to Language	220
D. Minority Concerns in Relation to Religion	226
E. Minorities and the Right to Culture	228
F. Other Covenant Articles Invoked to Provide Some Degree of Minority Protection	233
G. The Relationship between Article 27 and Other Covenant Provisions	235
H. The Economic and Social Rights of Minorities	239
I. The Question of Identification of Treaty Beneficiaries with respect to Minority-Related Provisions	241
J. The Human Rights Committee and Remedies	250
IV. Conclusion	251

7. Concluding Observations	253
I. The Enduring Minority Problem, Conflict Prevention & Human Rights	253
II. The 20th Century Experiment in Retrospect	256
III. A Brief Overview of the Parallel History of Regional Minority Protection Practice	260
A. A European Problem? Redressing the Eurocentric Focus on Minorities Issues	260
B. Overview of Regional Human Rights Systems and Minority Protection	262
C. The Absence of Express Minorities Clauses from Regional Human Rights Instruments after World War Two	263
D. The Practice of Quasi-Judicial Bodies and Courts	265
E. Human and Group Rights: Accelerated Standard-Setting and the Establishment of Monitoring Bodies after the Cold War	273
F. Institutional Policy and Promoting the Protection of Minorities	278
G. Building Institutions: Monitoring and Conflict Prevention	281
H. Summary on Regional Minority Protection Practice	285
IV. Conclusion: Between Hope and Despair	288
Appendix A: Treaty between the Principal Allied and Associated Powers and Poland	291
Appendix B: Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities	295
Appendix C: Approaches towards the Definition of Minorities and Related Groups by UN Bodies	299
1. Francesco Capotorti: Proposed Definition of 'Minorities' within the Context of Article 27, ICCPR: Study on the Rights of Persons Belonging to Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities (1979) E/CN.4/Sub.2/384/Rev.1	299
2. Jose Martinez-Cobo, Study of the Problem of Discrimination against Indigenous Populations: C/CN.4/Sub.2/186/7; Add.1(Vol.2), para. 379 (1987)	299
3. Jules Deschenes, Proposal Concerning a Definition of the Term 'Minority' E/CN.4/Sub.2/1985/31, 14 May 1985 at 30.	299
4. Asbjørn Eide, Working Definition on Minorities, Possible Ways and Means of Facilitating the Peaceful and Constructive Solution of Problems Involving Minorities, E/CN.4/Sub.2/1993/34, 10 August 1993, SCPDPM (45th Session), para 29.	299
5. Stanislav Chernichenko, Definition of Minorities, E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.5/1997/WP.1, 2 April 1997: Annex: Minorities - A Working Definition	300
6. Asbjørn Eide & Erica Irene Daes, Working Paper on the Relationship and Distinction between the Rights of Persons Belonging to Minorities and Those of Indigenous Peoples, Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (52nd Sess.) E/CN.4/Sub.2/2000/10	301
Appendix D: Draft Minority Protection Clauses	305
I. Proposals for Inclusion in the Declaration of Human Rights	305
II. Proposals for a Minority Protection Clause for the Covenant of Human Rights	306
Select Bibliography	307
Index	343